Dear Mr Howes

Almost one third of shark and ray species face extinction within decades, threatening the unravelling of entire ecosystems. As such, it is clear that their protection is a top priority for all of us working towards a shared vision of a healthy, thriving marine environment. Alongside Harvest Control Rules derived from science-based reference points, bycatch reduction and live release mitigation measures, the elimination of shark finning is a fundamental element for ensuring the protection and recovery of threatened species. Besides being an extremely cruel and wasteful form of exploitation of marine life, shark finning is an illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing activity in much of the world, which undermines effective management and conservation. As such, MSC has quite rightly stated that it takes a ‘zero tolerance’ approach towards the practice.

In this context, we welcome the inclusion of shark finning in the MSC’s ongoing Fisheries Standard Review (FSR) as it provides a key opportunity for the implementation of vital reforms which could subsequently incentivise broader change across the fishing industry. We are writing ahead of upcoming Board decisions related to the Fisheries Standard Review to express our view that a Fins Naturally Attached (FNA) policy in all fisheries interacting with sharks is the only way to effectively enact such a zero tolerance approach to shark finning and to request active, ongoing involvement as a stakeholder group in the policy development process leading up to decisions made at your December Board.

Call for the MSC to introduce a Fins Naturally Attached (FNA) policy

FNA is widely accepted, in the scientific literature and in management practice, to represent global best practice in preventing shark finning and, supported by effective monitoring and compliance, to be the only way of ensuring no finning can take place. FNA avoids many of the loopholes and ambiguities which limit effectiveness and enforcement of other approaches and facilitates species identification and collection of vital data. No alternative can offer the same level of confidence and therefore FNA is the only policy basis that is 100% consistent with MSC’s zero tolerance approach to shark finning. Furthermore, the MSC itself perceives FNA to be best practice, acknowledging in the guidance to the Fisheries Standard that “The MSC considers that a policy requiring the landing of all sharks with fins naturally attached is the most rigorous approach to ensuring that shark finning is not occurring.” However, despite this recognition, MSC has still not implemented FNA as a mandatory requirement or prerequisite (i.e. at SG60) for the certification of fisheries that interact with sharks, and alarmingly also does not require it even at higher scoring levels, thereby falling far behind the curve of global fisheries management.

We are therefore calling on the MSC to use this Fisheries Standard Review as an opportunity to align its policy with global best practice: evidence of shark finning must preclude a fishery from entering the certification process and any fisheries interacting with sharks as
primary, secondary or ETP species must have an FNA policy with no exemptions in place as a prerequisite for certification. The fishery must demonstrate compliance with the policy prior to, and throughout, certification with a level of monitoring and surveillance proportionate to the risk of finning occurring in that specific fishery.

It is of course critically important that the MSC remains globally accessible. However, it should be noted that FNA has been successfully adopted and implemented by a large number and range of countries, international bodies and fisheries management authorities. Additionally, it would be feasible for MSC to conduct an appropriate process to identify fisheries that might be concerned about financial or logistical challenges in implementing FNA and work with them to find effective solutions.

Request for active and constructive participation in the policy development process

We appreciated the opportunity to participate in the public workshops on this topic in July and the ability to provide further feedback as part of the survey on this topic. In line with both FAO and ISEAL guidance, transparent and participatory decision-making with adequate representation of all stakeholders is a vital principle underpinning ecolabelling schemes such as MSC.

We were however disappointed at the MSC’s delay in publishing reports from the workshops or the outcomes of the subsequent survey. Furthermore, we would respectfully urge that public engagement not be limited to narrow consultation windows or to singular questions and that, as highlighted by FAO, “balanced participation by independent technical experts and by representatives of interested parties” be ensured. Rather than presenting a completed proposal, drafted internally and then deliberated on by the Board, to stakeholders in 2021, by which stage it may be too late for fundamental changes, we instead urge the MSC to incorporate ongoing engagement with all stakeholder groups and perspectives throughout the process of developing and drafting proposals for the revision of the Standard.

We therefore write to request that representatives of this group of signatories be invited to attend TAB and STAC meetings in order to understand how feedback from workshops, surveys and other stakeholder engagement are being considered. Furthermore, we wish to request that we be given the opportunity to present to the MSC Board, Executive, TAB and STAC and discuss a proposal regarding the implementation of an FNA policy in the updated Standard, prior to a final proposal being selected for public consultation by the Board.

In light of the rapidly approaching TAB and STAC meetings, we look forward to receiving a response within the next two weeks and to continuing to engage with the MSC’s shark finning policy development process.

Yours sincerely,
Lisa Genasci  
CEO  
ADM Capital Foundation

Birgit Braun  
Executive Board Member  
Aktionsgemeinschaft Artenschutz (AGA) e.V.

Susan Millward  
Director Marine Animal Program  
Animal Welfare Institute

Dr. Jill Robinson  
Founder and CEO  
Animals Asia

José Truda Palazzo Jr.  
Vice President  
Augusto Carneiro Institute

Matthieu Lapinski  
President  
L'Association Ailerons

Dr. Leonardo Guida  
Shark scientist and AMCS spokesperson  
Australian Marine Conservation Society

Graham Buckingham  
Campaign Director  
Bite-Back Shark and Marine Conservation

Dr. Frédéric Le Manach  
Scientific Director  
BLOOM

Charles Clover  
Executive Director  
Blue Marine Foundation

John Hourston  
Director  
Blue Planet Society
Katrien Vandevelde and Jan Wouters
Founders
Blue Shark Conservation

Dr. Mark Jones
Head of Policy
Born Free Foundation

Ericka Ceballos
CEO
CATCA Environmental and Wildlife Society

Sarah Uhlemann
International Program Director and Senior Attorney
Center for Biological Diversity

Adam Weiss
Head of Programme: Ocean, Plastics and Chemicals
Client Earth

Isabel Naranjo
President
CREMA (Centro Rescate Especies Marinas Amenazadas)

Alejandra Goyenechea
Senior International Counsel
Defenders of Wildlife

Ulrike Kirsch
Foundation Board Member
Deutsche Stiftung Meeresschutz (DSM)

Paulo Guilherme Alves Cavalcanti
Co-founder
Divers for Sharks

Elise Dufour
Consultant
Dufour Productions

Georgina Wiersma
Director
Dutch Shark Society
Steve Trent
Founder and Executive Director
Environmental Justice Foundation

Felipe Vallejo
Executive Director
Equilibrio Azul

Billo Heinzpeter Studer
President
Fair Fish International Association

Randall Arauz
Policy Advisor
Fins Attached Marine Research and Conservation

Charles Redfern
Founder
Fish4Ever

Valeska Diemel
Director
FishAct

Jorge Serendero
CEO
For the Oceans Foundation

Sandra Bessudo Lion
Founder and Executive Director
Fundación Malpelo

Antoinette Vermilye
Co-Founder
Gallifrey Foundation

Ulrich Karlowski
Board Member
Gesellschaft zur Rettung der Delphine e.V.

Veerle Roelandt
President
The Global Shark Conservation Initiative
Alexandra Andersson
Founder
Hong Kong for Pangolins

Andrea Richey
Executive Director
Hong Kong Shark Foundation

Rebecca Regnery
Senior Director of Wildlife
Humane Society International

Dr. Phillipe Cury
Senior Scientist and Scientific Coordinator of EuroMarine
Institut de Recherche pour le Développement

David Phillips
Director
International Marine Mammal Project Earth Island Institute

Pierre-André Adam
Head of Science and Projects
Island Conservation Society

Dr. Gary WJ Ades
Department Head, Fauna Conservation Department
Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden Corporation

Dr. Silvia Frey
Marine conservation biologist
KYMA Sea Conservation and Research

Dr. Rachel T. Graham
Founder and Executive Director
MarAlliance

Hannah McIntyre
Fisheries and Aquaculture Manager
Marks and Spencer

Sandra Hinni
Fisheries Sustainability Project Manager
MIGROS
Maximillian Bello  
Ocean Policy Advisor  
Mission Blue  

Dr. Cornelia E. Nauen  
President  
Mundus maris absl  

Elizabeth Murdock  
Director, Pacific Ocean Initiative, Nature Program  
Natural Resources Defence Council (NRDC)  

Mark Wilkins  
Founder  
Nature Trust of the Americas  

Prof. Jennifer Jacquet  
Associate Professor of Environmental Studies  
New York University  

Doug Woodring  
Founder  
Ocean Recovery Alliance  

Louie Psihoyos  
Executive Director  
Oceanic Preservation Society  

Gary Stokes  
Director  
Oceans Asia  

Dr. Sandra Altherr  
Founder  
Pro Wildlife e.V.  

Suzanne M. Gendron  
Director  
Sage Advice  

Vince Cinches  
Save Sharks Network Philippines
Shawn Heinrichs  
Co-Founder  
Sea Legacy

Jorge Serendero  
President  
Sea Shepherd Costa Rica

Stefanie Brendl  
Executive Director and Founder  
Shark Allies

Brendon Sing  
Co-Director  
Shark Guardian

David McGuire  
Executive Director  
Shark Stewards

Ali Hood  
Director of Conservation  
The Shark Trust

Fernando Reis  
Executive Director  
Sharks Educational Institute

Fabienne Rossier  
President  
Sharks Mission France

Alexander Smolinsky  
President  
Sharkproject International

Brian W. Darvell  
University of Birmingham  
Former Chairman, Hong Kong Marine Conservation Society

Dr. David Dudgeon  
Emeritus Professor of Ecology and Biodiversity  
The University of Hong Kong
Prof. Yvonne Sadovy  
The University of Hong Kong

Dr. Kerstin Reichert  
Vice President  
German Underwater Federation (VDST)

Alex Hofford  
Wildlife campaigner  
WildAid

Colum Muccio  
Development Director  
Wildlife Rescue and Conservation Association

Dr. Ralf P. Sonntag  
Senior Advisor Oceans  
World Future Council

John Burton  
CEO  
World Wise Foods

Dr. Catherine (Cat) Dorey  
Independent Advisor on Fishes and Fisheries

Ila France Porcher  
Shark ethologist and author of ‘The True Nature of Sharks’ and ‘The Shark Sessions’

Karli Thomas  
Ocean Advocate

Ben Goldsmith  
International Pole and Line Foundation

Joseph Robertson (Aberdeen) Ltd.

Synchronicity Earth

Woolworths South Africa