

Dear Mr Howes

Almost one third of shark and ray species face extinction within decades, threatening the unravelling of entire ecosystems. As such, it is clear that their protection is a top priority for all of us working towards a shared vision of a healthy, thriving marine environment. Alongside Harvest Control Rules derived from science-based reference points, bycatch reduction and live release mitigation measures, the elimination of shark finning is a fundamental element for ensuring the protection and recovery of threatened species. Besides being an extremely cruel and wasteful form of exploitation of marine life, shark finning is an illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing activity in much of the world, which undermines effective management and conservation. As such, MSC has quite rightly stated that it takes a 'zero tolerance' approach towards the practice.

In this context, we welcome the inclusion of shark finning in the MSC's ongoing Fisheries Standard Review (FSR) as it provides a key opportunity for the implementation of vital reforms which could subsequently incentivise broader change across the fishing industry. We are writing ahead of upcoming Board decisions related to the Fisheries Standard Review to express our view that **a Fins Naturally Attached (FNA) policy in all fisheries interacting with sharks is the only way to effectively enact such a zero tolerance approach to shark finning** and to request **active, ongoing involvement as a stakeholder group in the policy development process** leading up to decisions made at your December Board.

*Call for the MSC to introduce a Fins Naturally Attached (FNA) policy*

FNA is widely accepted, in the scientific literature and in management practice, to represent global best practice in preventing shark finning and, supported by effective monitoring and compliance, to be the only way of ensuring no finning can take place. FNA avoids many of the loopholes and ambiguities which limit effectiveness and enforcement of other approaches and facilitates species identification and collection of vital data. No alternative can offer the same level of confidence and therefore FNA is the only policy basis that is 100% consistent with MSC's zero tolerance approach to shark finning. Furthermore, the MSC itself perceives FNA to be best practice, acknowledging in the guidance to the Fisheries Standard that "*The MSC considers that a policy requiring the landing of all sharks with fins naturally attached is the most rigorous approach to ensuring that shark finning is not occurring.*" However, despite this recognition, MSC has still not implemented FNA as a mandatory requirement or prerequisite (i.e. at SG60) for the certification of fisheries that interact with sharks, and alarmingly also does not require it even at higher scoring levels, thereby falling far behind the curve of global fisheries management.

We are therefore calling on the MSC to use this Fisheries Standard Review as an opportunity to align its policy with global best practice: **evidence of shark finning must preclude a fishery from entering the certification process and any fisheries interacting with sharks as**

**primary, secondary or ETP species must have an FNA policy with no exemptions** in place as a prerequisite for certification. The fishery must **demonstrate compliance** with the policy prior to, and throughout, certification with a level of monitoring and surveillance proportionate to the risk of finning occurring in that specific fishery.

It is of course critically important that the MSC remains globally accessible. However, it should be noted that FNA has been successfully adopted and implemented by a large number and range of countries, international bodies and fisheries management authorities. Additionally, it would be feasible for MSC to conduct an appropriate process to identify fisheries that might be concerned about financial or logistical challenges in implementing FNA and work with them to find effective solutions.

*Request for active and constructive participation in the policy development process*

We appreciated the opportunity to participate in the public workshops on this topic in July and the ability to provide further feedback as part of the survey on this topic. In line with both FAO and ISEAL guidance, transparent and participatory decision-making with adequate representation of all stakeholders is a vital principle underpinning ecolabelling schemes such as MSC.

We were however disappointed at the MSC's delay in publishing reports from the workshops or the outcomes of the subsequent survey. Furthermore, we would respectfully urge that public engagement not be limited to narrow consultation windows or to singular questions and that, as highlighted by FAO, "balanced participation by independent technical experts and by representatives of interested parties" be ensured. Rather than presenting a completed proposal, drafted internally and then deliberated on by the Board, to stakeholders in 2021, by which stage it may be too late for fundamental changes, we instead urge the MSC to incorporate ongoing engagement with all stakeholder groups and perspectives throughout the process of developing and drafting proposals for the revision of the Standard.

We therefore write to request that representatives of this group of signatories be invited to attend TAB and STAC meetings in order to understand how feedback from workshops, surveys and other stakeholder engagement are being considered. Furthermore, we wish to request that we be given the opportunity to present to the MSC Board, Executive, TAB and STAC and discuss a proposal regarding the implementation of an FNA policy in the updated Standard, prior to a final proposal being selected for public consultation by the Board.

In light of the rapidly approaching TAB and STAC meetings, we look forward to receiving a response within the next two weeks and to continuing to engage with the MSC's shark finning policy development process.

Yours sincerely,

**Lisa Genasci**

CEO

ADM Capital Foundation

**Birgit Braun**

Executive Board Member

Aktionsgemeinschaft Artenschutz (AGA) e.V.

**Susan Millward**

Director Marine Animal Program

Animal Welfare Institute

**Dr. Jill Robinson**

Founder and CEO

Animals Asia

**José Truda Palazzo Jr.**

Vice President

Augusto Carneiro Institute

**Matthieu Lapinski**

President

L'Association Ailerons

**Dr. Leonardo Guida**

Shark scientist and AMCS spokesperson

Australian Marine Conservation Society

**Graham Buckingham**

Campaign Director

Bite-Back Shark and Marine Conservation

**Dr. Frédéric Le Manach**

Scientific Director

BLOOM

**Charles Clover**

Executive Director

Blue Marine Foundation

**John Hourston**

Director

Blue Planet Society

**Katrien Vandevelde and Jan Wouters**

Founders  
Blue Shark Conservation

**Dr. Mark Jones**

Head of Policy  
Born Free Foundation

**Ericka Ceballos**

CEO  
CATCA Environmental and Wildlife Society

**Sarah Uhlemann**

International Program Director and Senior Attorney  
Center for Biological Diversity

**Isabel Naranjo**

President  
CREMA (Centro Rescate Especies Marinas Amenazadas)

**Alejandra Goyenechea**

Senior International Counsel  
Defenders of Wildlife

**Ulrike Kirsch**

Foundation Board Member  
Deutsche Stiftung Meeresschutz (DSM)

**Paulo Guilherme Alves Cavalcanti**

Co-founder  
Divers for Sharks

**Elise Dufour**

Consultant  
Dufour Productions

**Georgina Wiersma**

Director  
Dutch Shark Society

**Steve Trent**

Founder and Executive Director  
Environmental Justice Foundation

**Felipe Vallejo**  
Executive Director  
Equilibrio Azul

**Billo Heinzpeter Studer**  
President  
Fair Fish International Association

**Randall Arauz**  
Policy Advisor  
Fins Attached Marine Research and Conservation

**Charles Redfern**  
Founder  
Fish4Ever

**Valeska Diemel**  
Director  
FishAct

**Jorge Serendero**  
CEO  
For the Oceans Foundation

**Sandra Bessudo Lion**  
Founder and Executive Director  
Fundación Malpelo

**Antoinette Vermilye**  
Co-Founder  
Gallifrey Foundation

**Ulrich Karlowski**  
Board Member  
Gesellschaft zur Rettung der Delphine e.V.

**Veerle Roelandt**  
President  
The Global Shark Conservation Initiative

**Alexandra Andersson**  
Founder  
Hong Kong for Pangolins

**Andrea Richey**

Executive Director  
Hong Kong Shark Foundation

**Rebecca Regnery**

Senior Director of Wildlife  
Humane Society International

**Dr. Phillipe Cury**

Senior Scientist and Scientific Coordinator of EuroMarine  
Institut de Recherche pour le Développement

**David Phillips**

Director  
International Marine Mammal Project Earth Island Institute

**Pierre-André Adam**

Head of Science and Projects  
Island Conservation Society

**Dr. Silvia Frey**

Marine conservation biologist  
KYMA Sea Conservation and Research

**Dr. Rachel T. Graham**

Founder and Executive Director  
MarAlliance

**Hannah McIntyre**

Fisheries and Aquaculture Manager  
Marks and Spencer

**Sandra Hinni**

Fisheries Sustainability Project Manager  
MIGROS

**Maximillian Bello**

Ocean Policy Advisor  
Mission Blue

**Dr. Cornelia E. Nauen**

President  
Mundus maris absI

**Elizabeth Murdock**

Director, Pacific Ocean Initiative, Nature Program  
Natural Resources Defence Council (NRDC)

**Mark Wilkins**

Founder  
Nature Trust of the Americas

**Prof. Jennifer Jacquet**

Associate Professor of Environmental Studies  
New York University

**Louie Psihoyos**

Executive Director  
Oceanic Preservation Society

**Gary Stokes**

Director  
Oceans Asia

**Dr. Sandra Altherr**

Founder  
Pro Wildlife e.V.

**Suzanne M. Gendron**

Director  
Sage Advice

**Shawn Heinrichs**

Co-Founder  
Sea Legacy

**Jorge Serendero**

President  
Sea Shepherd Costa Rica

**Stefanie Brendl**

Executive Director and Founder  
Shark Allies

**Brendon Sing**

Co-Director  
Shark Guardian

**David McGuire**  
Executive Director  
Shark Stewards

**Ali Hood**  
Director of Conservation  
The Shark Trust

**Fernando Reis**  
Executive Director  
Sharks Educational Institute

**Fabienne Rossier**  
President  
Sharks Mission France

**Alexander Smolinsky**  
President  
Sharkproject International

**Brian W. Darvell**  
University of Birmingham  
Former Chairman, Hong Kong Marine Conservation Society

**Dr. David Dudgeon**  
Emeritus Professor of Ecology and Biodiversity  
The University of Hong Kong

**Prof. Yvonne Sadovy**  
The University of Hong Kong

**Dr. Kerstin Reichert**  
Vice President  
German Underwater Federation (VDST)

**Alex Hofford**  
Wildlife campaigner  
WildAid

**Colum Muccio**  
Development Director  
Wildlife Rescue and Conservation Association



**Dr. Ralf P. Sonntag**  
Senior Advisor Oceans  
World Future Council

**John Burton**  
CEO  
World Wise Foods

**Dr. Catherine (Cat) Dorey**  
Independent Advisor on Fishes and Fisheries

**Ila France Porcher**  
Shark ethologist and author of 'The True Nature of Sharks' and 'The Shark Sessions'

**Karli Thomas**  
Ocean Advocate

**Ben Goldsmith**

**International Pole and Line Foundation**

**Synchronicity Earth**

**Woolworths South Africa**

